

**Relaxation and discretization  
of control problems in the coefficients  
with a nonlinear functional in the gradient**

**Juan Casado-Díaz**  
**University of Sevilla**

## Model problem:

$\alpha, \beta, \mu > 0$ ,  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^N$  open, bounded,  $f \in H^{-1}(\Omega)$

$F_i: \Omega \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  Carathéodory functions,  $i = 1, 2$ ,

$$|F_i(x, s, \xi)| \leq C(1 + |s|^2 + |\xi|^2)$$

$$(CP) \quad \inf \left( \int_{\omega} F_1(x, u, \nabla u) dx + \int_{\Omega \setminus \omega} F_2(x, u, \nabla u) dx \right)$$

$$\begin{cases} -\operatorname{div} \left( (\alpha \chi_{\omega} + \beta \chi_{\Omega \setminus \omega}) \nabla u \right) = f & \text{in } \Omega \\ u = 0 & \text{on } \partial \Omega \end{cases}$$

$$\omega \subset \Omega \text{ measurable, } |\omega| \leq \mu$$

**F. Murat.** This problem has not a solution in general.

It is interesting to work with a relaxed formulation.

F. Murat, L.Tartar. If the functional to minimize is

$$\int_{\omega} G_1(x, u)dx + \int_{\Omega \setminus \omega} G_2(x, u)dx + \int_{\Omega} h(x, u)(\alpha \chi_{\omega} + \beta \chi_{\Omega \setminus \omega})|\nabla u|^2 dx,$$

A relaxation of (CP) is given by

$$(RCP) \quad \inf \int_{\Omega} (\theta G_1(x, u) + (1 - \theta)G_2(x, u) + h(x, u)M\nabla u\nabla u)dx$$

$$\begin{cases} -\operatorname{div}(M\nabla u) = f \text{ in } \Omega \\ u = 0 \text{ on } \partial \Omega \end{cases} \quad M \in \mathcal{K}(\theta), \quad \int_{\Omega} \theta \leq \mu$$

$\mathcal{K}(\theta)$  set of matrices constructed via homogenization using  $\alpha$  with proportion  $\theta$  and  $\beta$  with proportion  $1 - \theta$ .

L. Tartar. K. Lurie, A. Cherkaev characterize  $\mathcal{K}(p)$ ,  $0 \leq p \leq 1$

$$\text{Define } \lambda(p) = \left( \frac{p}{\alpha} + \frac{1-p}{\beta} \right)^{-1}, \quad \Lambda(p) = p\alpha + (1-p)\beta,$$

If  $N \geq 2$ ,  $\mathcal{K}(p)$  is the set of symmetric matrices with eigenvalues satisfying

$$\lambda(p) \leq \lambda_1 \leq \dots \leq \lambda_N \leq \Lambda(p)$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^N \frac{1}{\lambda_i - \alpha} \leq \frac{N-1}{\Lambda(p) - \alpha} + \frac{1}{\lambda(p) - \alpha}$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^N \frac{1}{\beta - \lambda_i} \leq \frac{N-1}{\beta - \Lambda(p)} + \frac{1}{\beta - \lambda(p)}$$

For our purpose it is enough to know  $\mathcal{K}(p)\xi$ ,  $\xi \in \mathbb{R}^N$

$$\mathcal{K}(p)\xi = \begin{cases} B \left( \frac{\lambda(p) + \Lambda(p)}{2} \xi, \frac{\Lambda(p) - \lambda(p)}{2} |\xi| \right) & \text{if } N \geq 2 \\ \lambda(p)\xi & \text{if } N = 1 \end{cases}$$

In general (JCD, J. Couce-Calvo, J.D. Martín-Gómez) the relaxed control problem has the form

$$\inf \int_{\Omega} H(x, u, \nabla u, M\nabla u, \theta) dx$$

$$\begin{cases} -\operatorname{div}(M\nabla u) = f \text{ in } \Omega \\ u = 0 \text{ on } \partial \Omega \end{cases} \quad M \in \mathcal{K}(\theta), \quad \int_{\Omega} \theta dx \leq \mu,$$

or equivalently 
$$\inf \int_{\Omega} H(x, u, \nabla u, \sigma, \theta) dx$$

$$-\operatorname{div} \sigma = f \text{ in } \Omega, \quad u \in H_0^1(\Omega), \quad \sigma \in K(\theta)\nabla u, \quad \int_{\Omega} \theta dx \leq \mu.$$

Related results: Allaire, Bellido, Grabovski, Gutiérrez, Maestre, Munch, Pedregal, Tartar, ...

**Remark:** If  $(u_n, \omega_n)$  are solution of

$$-\operatorname{div}\left((\alpha\chi_{\omega_n} + \beta\chi_{\Omega\setminus\omega_n})\nabla u_n\right) = f \text{ in } \Omega, \quad u_n = 0 \text{ on } \partial\Omega,$$

then for a subsequence we have

$$u_n \rightharpoonup u \text{ in } H_0^1(\Omega), \quad \theta_n = \chi_{\omega_n} \overset{*}{\rightharpoonup} \theta \text{ in } L^\infty(\Omega)$$

$$\sigma_n = (\alpha\chi_{\omega_n} + \beta\chi_{\Omega\setminus\omega_n})\nabla u_n \rightharpoonup \sigma \text{ in } L^2(\Omega)^N$$

$$\operatorname{div}\sigma_n \rightarrow \operatorname{div}\sigma \text{ in } H^{-1}(\Omega).$$

We write  $(u_n, \sigma_n, \theta_n) \overset{\tau}{\rightharpoonup} (u, \sigma, \theta)$ .

$$\bar{\mathcal{F}}(u, \sigma, \theta) = \int_{\Omega} H(x, u, \nabla u, \sigma, \theta) dx$$

is the lower semicontinuous envelope for the  $\tau$ -convergence of  $\mathcal{F}$  given by

$$\mathcal{F}(u, \sigma, \theta) = \int_{\omega} F_1(x, u, \nabla u) dx + \int_{\Omega \setminus \omega} F_2(x, u, \nabla u) dx$$

if  $\theta = \chi_{\omega}$ ,  $\sigma = (\alpha \chi_{\omega} + \beta \chi_{\Omega \setminus \omega}) \nabla u$ ,

$\mathcal{F}(u, \sigma, \theta) = +\infty$  otherwise.

If  $N = 1$ ,

$$H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) = \begin{cases} pF_1\left(x, s, \frac{\eta}{\alpha}\right) + (1-p)F_2\left(x, s, \frac{\eta}{\alpha}\right) & \text{if } \eta = \lambda(p)\xi \\ +\infty & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

If  $N > 1$ , we have

- $\text{Dom}(H) = \{(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) : \eta \in \mathcal{K}(p)\xi\}$ .
- $|H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p)| \leq C(1 + |s|^2 + |\xi|^2 + |\eta|^2)$
- $H$  satisfies the following convexity property

$$\begin{aligned} & H(x, s, \gamma\xi_1 + (1-\gamma)\xi_2, \gamma\eta_1 + (1-\gamma)\eta_2, \gamma p_1 + (1-\gamma)p_2) \\ & \leq \gamma H(x, s, \xi_1, \eta_1, p_1) + (1-\gamma)H(x, s, \xi_2, \eta_2, p_2) \\ & \quad \text{if } \gamma \in [0,1], (\xi_2 - \xi_1) \cdot (\eta_2 - \eta_1) = 0. \end{aligned}$$

•

$$\begin{aligned} H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) &= pF_1\left(x, s, \frac{\beta\xi - \eta}{(\beta - \alpha)p}\right) + (1-p)F_1\left(x, s, \frac{\eta - \alpha\xi}{(\beta - \alpha)(1-p)}\right) \\ & \quad \text{if } \eta \in \partial\mathcal{K}(p)\xi \end{aligned}$$



- If  $F_i(x, s, \xi)$ ,  $i = 1, 2$ , are convex in  $\xi$ , we have

$$H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) \geq pF_1\left(x, s, \frac{\beta\xi - \eta}{(\beta - \alpha)p}\right) + (1 - p)F_1\left(x, s, \frac{\eta - \alpha\xi}{(\beta - \alpha)(1 - p)}\right).$$

Cases where  $H$  is known

$$F_2(x, s, \xi) = r(x, s)|\xi|^2$$

$$Q(x, s, \xi) = F_1(x, s, \xi) - \frac{\alpha}{\beta}r(x, s)|\xi|^2 \text{ convex in } \xi.$$

$$\Rightarrow H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) = \frac{h(x, s)}{\beta}\xi \cdot \eta + pQ\left(x, s, \frac{\eta - \beta\xi}{p(\beta - \alpha)}\right)$$

It contains some cases proved by [Bellido, Pedregal](#), [Grabovsky](#), ...

$\forall(x, s, \xi)$ ,  $\exists \zeta \in \mathbb{R}^N$  such that the applications  $t \rightarrow F_i(x, s, \xi + t\zeta)$  are linear.

$$\Rightarrow H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) = pF_1\left(x, s, \frac{\beta\xi - \eta}{(\beta - \alpha)p}\right) + (1 - p)F_1\left(x, s, \frac{\eta - \alpha\xi}{(\beta - \alpha)(1 - p)}\right)$$

# Numerical Approximation

JCD, C. Couce-Calvo, M. Luna-Laynez, J.D. Martín-Gómez.

A discretization using an upper approximation of  $H$

Take  $\bar{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p)$ , with

$$\bar{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) \geq H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p)$$

$$\bar{H}(x, s, \xi, \alpha\xi, 1) = F_1(x, s, \xi), \quad \bar{H}(x, s, \xi, \beta\xi, 0) = F_2(x, s, \xi).$$

For  $h > 0$ , we consider a triangulation  $\mathcal{T}_h = \{T_{i,h}\}_{i=1}^{n_h}$  of  $\Omega$

$$\Omega = \bigcup_{i=1}^{n_h} T_{i,h}, \quad T_{i,h} \text{ measurable, } |T_{i,h}| > 0, \quad \text{diam}(T_{i,h}) \leq h$$

$$|T_{i,h} \cap T_{j,h}| = 0, \quad \text{if } i \neq j,$$

and a sequence of closed subspaces  $V_h \subset H_0^1(\Omega)$

## Discretized problem

$$\min \int_{\Omega} \bar{H}(x, u_h, \nabla u_h, M_h \nabla u_h, \theta_h) dx$$

$$0 \leq \theta_h \leq 1, \int_{\Omega} \theta_h dx \leq \mu^i, \quad M_h \in \mathcal{K}(\theta_h) \text{ a.e. in } \Omega$$

$$u_h \in V_h, \int_{\Omega} M_h \nabla u_h \cdot \nabla v_h dx = \int_{\Omega} f v_h dx, \quad \forall v_h \in V_h$$

$M_h, \theta_h$  constants in the elements  $T_{i,h}$

## Assumptions on $V_h$

i)

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \min_{v_h \in V_h} \|v - v_h\|_{H_0^1(\Omega)} = 0, \quad \forall v \in H_0^1(\Omega),$$

ii)

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \min_{v_h \in V_h} \|w_h \varphi - v_h\|_{H_0^1(\Omega)} = 0,$$

$$\forall w_h \in V_h \text{ bounded in } H_0^1(\Omega), \forall \varphi \in C_c^\infty(\Omega)$$

iii)

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \int_{\Omega} H(x, u_h, \nabla u_h, \sigma_h, \theta_h) dx \geq \int_{\Omega} H(x, u, \nabla u, \sigma, \theta) dx$$

$$\forall u_h \rightharpoonup u \text{ in } H_0^1(\Omega), u_h \in V_h, \quad \forall \sigma_h \rightharpoonup \sigma \text{ in } L^2(\Omega)^N$$

$$\forall \theta_h \overset{*}{\rightharpoonup} \theta \text{ in } L^\infty(\Omega), \quad 0 \leq \theta_h \leq 1 \text{ a.e. in } \Omega$$

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \max_{v_h \in V_h} \frac{1}{\|v_h\|_{H_0^1(\Omega)}} \int_{\Omega} (\sigma_h - \sigma) \cdot \nabla v_h dx = 0.$$

Properties i), ii), iii) are satisfied for  $V_h = H_0^1(\Omega)$ .

If  $V_h$  is a usual space of finite elements, it satisfies i), ii).

In the examples where we know  $H$ , every sequence  $V_h$  satisfies iii).

**Theorem:** The discrete problem has a solution  $(u_h, M_h, \theta_h)$

$$\text{Up to a subsequence} \quad \begin{cases} u_h \rightharpoonup u \text{ in } H_0^1(\Omega) \\ M_h \nabla u_h \rightharpoonup M \nabla u \text{ in } L^2(\Omega)^N \\ \theta_h \overset{*}{\rightharpoonup} \theta \text{ in } L^\infty(\Omega) \end{cases}$$

$$(u, M, \theta) \text{ solution of } \begin{cases} \inf_{\Omega} \int H(x, u, \nabla u, M \nabla u, \theta) dx \\ -\operatorname{div}(M \nabla u) = f \text{ in } \Omega, \quad u = 0 \text{ on } \partial\Omega \\ 0 \leq \theta \leq 1, \quad M \in K(\theta) \text{ a.e.,} \quad \int_{\Omega} \theta dx \leq \mu \end{cases}$$

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \int_{\Omega} \overline{H}(x, u_h, \nabla u_h, M_h \nabla u_h, \theta_h) dx = \int_{\Omega} H(x, u, \nabla u, M \nabla u, \theta) dx.$$

### Example 1:

$$\bar{H}(x, s, \xi, A\xi, 1) = F_1(x, s, \xi), \quad \bar{H}(x, s, \xi, B\xi, 0) = F_2(x, s, \xi)$$

$$\bar{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) = +\infty \text{ otherwise.}$$

In this case, we are solving a discrete version of the original (unrelaxed) problem, i.e.

$$\inf \left( \int_{\omega} F_1(x, u_h, \nabla u_h) dx + \int_{\Omega \setminus \omega} F_2(x, u_h, \nabla u_h) dx \right)$$

$$u_h \in V_h$$

$$\left\{ \int_{\Omega} (\alpha \chi_{\omega_h} + \beta \chi_{\Omega \setminus \omega_h}) \nabla u_h \cdot \nabla v_h dx = \int_{\Omega} f v_h dx, \quad \forall v_h \in V_h \right.$$

$$\omega_h \text{ a union of elements of } \mathcal{T}_h, \quad |\omega_h| \leq \mu.$$

**Example 2:** ( $N \geq 2$ ) Since we know the values of  $\bar{H}$  in the boundary of its domain, we can take

$$\begin{aligned} \bar{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) \\ = pF_1\left(x, s, \frac{\beta\xi - \eta}{p(\beta - \alpha)}\right) + (1 - p)F_2\left(x, s, \frac{\eta - \alpha\xi}{(1 - p)(\beta - \alpha)}\right) \end{aligned}$$

if  $\eta \in \partial\mathcal{K}(p)\xi$

$\bar{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) = +\infty$  elsewhere.

**Clearly**, when we know the function  $H$  we can just take  $\bar{H} = H$ .

## A lower approximation of $H$

We consider  $\underline{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p)$  with

$$\underline{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) \leq H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p)$$

For  $h > 0$ , consider  $\mathcal{T}_h = \{T_{i,h}\}_{i=1}^{n_h}$  as above and closed subspaces  $V_h \subset H_0^1(\Omega)$  satisfying properties i) and ii) as above and

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \int_{\Omega} \underline{H}(x, u_h, \nabla u_h, \sigma_h, \theta_h) dx \geq \int_{\Omega} \underline{H}(x, u, \nabla u, \sigma, \theta) dx$$

$$\forall u_h \rightharpoonup u \text{ in } H_0^1(\Omega), \quad u_h \in V_h, \quad \forall \sigma_h \rightharpoonup \sigma \text{ in } L^2(\Omega)^N$$

$$\forall \theta_h \overset{*}{\rightharpoonup} \theta \text{ in } L^\infty(\Omega), \quad 0 \leq \theta_h \leq 1 \text{ a.e. in } \Omega$$

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \max_{v_h \in V_h} \frac{1}{\|v_h\|_{H_0^1(\Omega)}} \int_{\Omega} (\sigma_h - \sigma) \cdot \nabla v_h dx = 0.$$



**Discretized problem**  $\mathfrak{C} = \text{co}\{(M, p): M \in \mathcal{K}(p)\}$

$$\min \int_{\Omega} \underline{H}(x, u_h, \nabla u_h, M_h \nabla u_h, \theta_h) dx$$

$$0 \leq \theta_h \leq 1, \quad \int_{\Omega} \theta_h dx \leq \mu^i, \quad (\theta_h, M_h) \in \mathfrak{C} \text{ a.e. in } \Omega$$

$$u_h \in V^h, \quad \int_{\Omega} M_h \nabla u_h \cdot \nabla v_h dx = \int_{\Omega} f v_h dx, \quad \forall v_h \in V^h$$

$M_h, \theta_h$  constants in the elements  $T_{i,h}$

**Theorem:** The discrete problem has a solution  $(u_h, M_h, \theta_h)$

$$\text{Up to a subsequence} \quad \begin{cases} u_h \rightharpoonup u \text{ in } H_0^1(\Omega) \\ M_h \nabla u_h \rightharpoonup M \nabla u \text{ in } L^2(\Omega)^N \\ \theta_h \overset{*}{\rightharpoonup} \theta \text{ in } L^\infty(\Omega) \end{cases}$$

$$(u, M, \theta) \text{ solution of } \begin{cases} \inf_{\Omega} \int \underline{H}(x, u, \nabla u, M \nabla u, \theta) dx \\ -\operatorname{div}(M \nabla u) = f \text{ in } \Omega, \quad u = 0 \text{ on } \partial\Omega \\ 0 \leq \theta \leq 1, \quad M \in K(\theta) \text{ a.e.}, \quad \int_{\Omega} \theta dx \leq \mu \end{cases}$$

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \int_{\Omega} \underline{H}(x, u_h, \nabla u_h, M_h \nabla u_h, \theta_h) dx = \int_{\Omega} \underline{H}(x, u, \nabla u, M \nabla u, \theta) dx$$

**Remark:** Looking for the optimality conditions, we hope that the solution  $(\hat{u}, \hat{M}, \hat{\theta})$  satisfies

$$\hat{M}\nabla\hat{u} \in \partial\mathcal{K}(\hat{\theta})\nabla\hat{u} \text{ a.e. in } \Omega.$$

Thus, we need to take  $\underline{H}$  satisfying

$$\underline{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) = H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) \text{ if } \eta \in \partial\mathcal{K}(p)\xi.$$

**Example:** If  $F_1(x, s, \xi), F_2(x, s, \xi)$  are convex in  $\xi$  take

$$\begin{aligned} \underline{H}(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) &= H(x, s, \xi, \eta, p) \\ &= pF\left(x, s, \frac{\beta\xi - \eta}{p(\beta - \alpha)}\right) + (1 - p)F\left(x, s, \frac{\eta - \alpha\xi}{(1 - p)(\beta - \alpha)}\right) \end{aligned}$$

We have shown that we can solve numerically the control problem discretizing the unrelaxed or the relaxed problem.

What is better?

J. CD, C. Castro, M. Luna-Laynez, E. Zuazua consider the case  $N = 1$ .

**Control problem (CP)**  $F_1, F_2 \in W^{1,\infty}$

$$\inf \left( \int_{\omega} F_1 \left( x, u, \frac{du}{dx} \right) dx + \int_{(0,1)\setminus\omega} F_2 \left( x, u, \frac{du}{dx} \right) dx \right)$$
$$\begin{cases} -\frac{d}{dx} \left( (\alpha \chi_{\omega} + \beta \chi_{(0,1)\setminus\omega}) \frac{du}{dx} \right) = f \text{ in } (0,1) & |\omega| \leq \mu \\ u(0) = u(1) = 0 \end{cases}$$

**Relaxed formulation (RCP)**

$$\min \int_0^1 \left( \theta F_1 \left( x, u, \frac{\lambda(\theta) du}{\alpha dx} \right) + (1 - \theta) F_2 \left( x, u, \frac{\lambda(\theta) du}{\beta dx} \right) \right) dx$$
$$\begin{cases} -\frac{d}{dx} \left( \lambda(\theta) \frac{du}{dx} \right) = f \text{ in } (0,1) & \int_0^1 \theta dx \leq \mu. \\ u(0) = u(1) = 0 \end{cases}$$

## Discretization

We take a partition  $\mathcal{P}_r$  and refinement  $\mathcal{Q}_h$  of respective diameters  $r$  and  $h$

$$V_h = \{u \in C_0^0([0,1]): u \text{ is affine in each interval of } \mathcal{Q}_h\}$$

We consider the discretized problems

$$(DCP) \begin{cases} \min \left( \int_{\omega} F_1 \left( x, u, \frac{du}{dx} \right) dx + \int_{(0,1)\setminus\omega} F_1 \left( x, u, \frac{du}{dx} \right) dx \right) \\ u \in V_h \\ \int_0^1 \left( \alpha \chi_{\omega} + \beta \chi_{(0,1)\setminus\omega} \right) \frac{du}{dx} \frac{dv}{dx} dx = \int_0^1 f v dx, \quad \forall v \in V_h \\ \omega \text{ is a union of intervals of } \mathcal{P}_r, \quad |\omega| \leq \mu. \end{cases}$$

$$\min \int_{\omega} \left( \theta F_1 \left( x, u, \frac{\lambda(\theta)}{\alpha} \frac{du}{dx} \right) + (1 - \theta) F_2 \left( x, u, \frac{\lambda(\theta)}{\beta} \frac{du}{dx} \right) \right) dx$$

(DRP)

$$\begin{cases} u \in V_h \\ \int_0^1 \lambda(\theta) \frac{du}{dx} \frac{dv}{dx} dx = \int_0^1 f v dx, \quad \forall v \in V_h \end{cases}$$

$\theta$  is constant in the intervals of  $\mathcal{P}_r$ ,  $\int_0^1 \theta dx \leq \mu$

**Theorem.** Taking  $r = h$  and  $f \in W^{1,l}(0,1)$  we have

$$|\min(RCP) - \min(DCP)| \leq ch^{\frac{l+1}{l+2}}.$$

Taking  $f \in L^\infty(0,1)$ ,  $r = \sqrt{h}$  and assuming that there exists an optimal control in  $BV(0,1)$ , we have

$$|\min(RCP) - \min(DRP)| \leq ch.$$